## CHAPTER 1 What Is It to Be a Professional? The Professions, Leadership, and Work

The readings in this chapter introduce some of the issues that arise when we ask what it means to be a professional, such as having reliable expertise, a standardized code of ethics, and trustworthy leadership qualities. Professional ethics in some specific fields are also examined, including the medical, legal, and engineering professions.

## Henry Mintzberg | The Professional Organization

Mintzberg first discusses the basic structure and uniqueness of professional organizations and how they differ from machine bureaucracies and innovative organizations. He then presents various forms and models of professional organizations. Finally, he shows how the characteristics of being both democratic and autonomous can lead to favorable as well as unfavorable conditions among professionals.

- 1. \*In which type of organization do the workers appear to manage their bosses?
  - a. the machine organization.
  - b. the innovative organization.
  - c. \*the professional organization.
  - d. the top-down organization.
- 2. Training for professionals requires years of both formal \_\_\_\_\_ as well as the application of expertise and skills in on-the-job training.
  - a. technology
  - b. \*education
  - c. calculation
  - d. operation
- 3. \*In which way does the professional bureaucracy differ from the machine bureaucracy?
  - a. \*Its standards originate in self-governing associations outside its own structure.
  - b. It generates standards through its technostructure.
  - c. It generates standards enforced by its line managers.
  - d. It emphasizes the power of office.
- 4. The fact that professional operators require little supervision suggests that the structure of a professional organization is that of a(n)
  - a. innovative enterprise.
  - b. \*inverse pyramid.
  - c. single purpose structure.
  - d. laissez-faire power.
- 5. \*Administrators maintain power over professionals only as long as they
  - a. impose solutions on professionals involved in a dispute.
  - b. maintain top-down hierarchies of power.
  - c. control professionals according to the will of outside financial agencies.
  - d. \*are perceived as effectively serving the interests of the professionals.
- 6. Which of the following models describes a professional organization built on *common interest* as the guiding force, in which decision-making is by consensus?
  - a. the garbage can model
  - b. the political model
  - c. \*the collegial model
  - d. the craft enterprise model
- 7. \*Two unique characteristics of professionals that can lead to both favorable as well as unfavorable situations are
  - a. \*democracy and autonomy.
  - b. disinterest and respect.
  - c. discretion and innovation.

d. cooperation and collabo	ration.
----------------------------	---------

- 8. Considerable personal \_\_\_\_\_\_ is required when most of the discretion is put into the hands of single professionals.
  - a. strength
  - b. indifference
  - c. \*judgment
  - d. loyalty
- 9. \*Resistance to innovation by professionals is due to their
  - a. reluctance to work individually.
  - b. \*reluctance to cooperate with each other.
  - c. tendency to think inductively.
  - d. tendency to see the general in the specific.
- 10. Change in professional organizations may be brought about best by calling on professionals' sense of
  - a. individual freedom.
  - b. hierarchy of power.
  - c. technocratic control.
  - d. \*public responsibility.

#### **Essay Questions**

1. Mintzberg states that we can best understand professional organizations as upside-down or inverse pyramid structures, in which the workers "manage their own bosses." Do you agree with this assessment of how these organizations function and the roles administrators play with respect to professionals, support staff, and outside agencies? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Mintzberg's position that professional organizations fit this upside-down structure, providing reasons and examples from this article in addition to those of your own; or
- Argue *against* Mintzberg's position that professional organizations fit this upside-down structure, providing reasons and examples from your experience that counter those in this article.
- 2. According to Mintzberg, professional organizations have two unique characteristics: (i) they are *democratic*, and (ii) they bestow extensive *autonomy* on individual professionals. How can these two characteristics lead to advantageous results on the one hand and to unfortunate consequences on the other?

A good essay will either:

- Articulate Mintzberg's argument, providing solid reasons and examples demonstrating that these two characteristics can lead to both negative and positive results; or
- Articulate your own counterargument, providing solid reasons and examples demonstrating that these two characteristics need not lead to both negative and positive results in this manner.

#### Michael D. Bayles | The Professions

In this reading, Bayles discusses the characteristics of being a professional and the complex relationship between generally autonomous professionals and their supervisors. He distinguishes between consulting and scholarly professions, concluding with a discussion of how professions monopolize services in order to keep out untrained practitioners.

- 1. \*Which of the following is NOT a characteristic associated with being a professional?
  - a. autonomy in individual work
  - b. extensive intellectual training
  - c. \*an instinctive skill
  - d. an ability that provides a service to society

2. Professionals are trained to provide advice rather than to society.  a. guidance b. *things c. counsel d. instruction
<ul> <li>3. *Professional associations and organizations differ from trade unions in that they <ul> <li>a. are devoted primarily to members' economic interests.</li> <li>b. develop ethical codes to ensure fulfillment of the relevant service.</li> <li>c. *seek to advance all goals of the profession, including members' economic interests.</li> <li>d. seek to advance safety, efficiency, and justice within the profession.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
4. In large bureaucratic organizations, supervisors may seek to limit the of professionals if thei personal judgments are seen to exceed the bounds of acceptable practice.  a. *autonomy b. skills c. safety d. common interest
5. *An important distinction among professionals is between and consulting work.  a. technical b. *scholarly c. confidential d. economic
6. Which type of professional has traditionally practiced on a fee-for-service basis?  a. *consulting b. scholarly c. supervisory d. economic
7. *Which of the following is NOT considered a consulting profession?  a. physicians b. lawyers c. dentists d. *journalists
8. The services professionals provide, such as justice, equality, safety, and health, portray the of a society.  a. hierarchy b. *values c. laws d. perceptions
<ul> <li>9. *Why do professionals tend to have a monopoly over the provision of services?</li> <li>a. to prevent supervisors from overriding their discretionary judgments</li> <li>b. *to prevent those who are not legally prepared or licensed from practicing</li> <li>c. to ensure that everyone is allowed to practice, regardless of education</li> <li>d. to make it easier for clients to act without professional help</li> </ul>
10. A is a permission to perform certain acts provided specified conditions are fulfilled.  a. right b. social good c. monopoly d. *privilege

**Essay Questions** 

1. According to Bayles, what specific characteristics are shared by most professionals, and how do they function similarly or differently in both *consulting* and *scholarly* professional work? Do you agree with his assessment? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Articulate Bayles's understanding of professional characteristics and how they are represented in these two areas, providing examples from this article in addition to those of your own; or
- Articulate your own understanding of what characteristics are required in a professional and how
  they are represented in these two areas, providing examples from this article in addition to those
  of your own.
- 2. Bayles argues that professionals have the *privilege* of practicing their work as opposed to having a *right* to practice. Do you agree? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Bayles's view on privileges versus rights in professional practice, providing reasons and examples from this article in addition to those of your own; or
- Argue *against* Bayles's view on privileges versus rights in professional practice, countering Bayles's reasons and examples with those of your own.

## Michael Davis | Professional Responsibility: Just Following the Rules?

Davis criticizes the view that professional responsibility goes beyond merely following the rules of one's code of ethics by necessarily involving certain character virtues. Rather, if a code of ethics is well-written, following these rules means that a professional *is* acting responsibly. He discusses seven different interpretations of "just following the rules": blind obedience, strict obedience, malicious obedience, negligent obedience, accidental obedience, stupid obedience, concluding with a positive discussion of interpretative obedience.

- 1. \*Davis criticizes the view that
  - a. \*professional responsibility involves moral choices and is therefore more open-ended than legalism.
  - b. following the rules of a well-written code of ethics means that a professional is acting responsibly.
  - c. legalism requires the integration of certain character virtues.
  - d. professional responsibility and following the rules amount to the same thing.
- 2. Most professionals are able to discern whether a particular service is within their area of
  - a. confidence
  - b. vision
  - c. contention
  - d. \*competence
- 3. \*Which of the following defines blind obedience?
  - a. when we allow our own judgment to be short-circuited by someone else's
  - b. when there is a division of labor among those giving and those following a rule
  - c. \*doing what the rule says without concern for context or consequence
  - d. when there is understanding about what the rule means and how it functions as a guide to conduct

4. "Working to rule" most resembles	obedience.
a. accidental	
b. negligent	
c. malicious	
d. *strict	

- 5. \*Malicious obedience is
  - a. an unconscious failure to take reasonable care in interpreting the rules.
  - b. \*a conscious failure to take reasonable care in interpreting the rules.
  - c. understanding that rules cannot always anticipate special cases.
  - d. taking reasonable care in interpreting the rules.

- 6. Which of the following is NOT a characteristic associated with negligent obedience?
  - a. when the failure to follow the rules unreasonably risks harm to others
  - b. when there is a failure to provide good practice
  - c. when there is a failure to exercise due care in following the relevant rules
  - d. \*when the failure to follow the rules is a matter of competence
- 7. \*In accidental obedience,
  - a. \*there is a failure to follow the rule for the right reason.
  - b. due care is never achieved.
  - c. the rules of good practice are properly understood.
  - d. the motivation for following a rule is never greed or fear of punishment.
- 8. The most common form of stupid obedience in professional ethics is
  - a. reading a code of ethics as if each rule were dependent of the others.
  - b. \*reading a code of ethics as if each rule were independent of the others.
  - c. to blame oneself rather than a state of affairs.
  - d. properly understanding and following the rules.
- 9. \*Each type of rule-following acknowledges that rules must be interpreted in some way EXCEPT obedience.
  - a. \*blind
  - b. malicious
  - c. strict
  - d. accidental
- 10. According to Davies, a comprehensive interpretation of a professional code of ethics should include all but
  - a. understanding the history of the profession.
  - b. knowledge of the organizations in which members of the profession work
  - c. understanding the purpose of the rules as applied to practice.
  - d. \*an interpretation of each rule independently of the others.

## **Essay Questions**

1. How does Davis argue against critics who distinguish between the *letter* of a rule and the *spirit* of a rule? Do his general and specific answers fit with his overall argument about what it means to follow a professional code of ethics? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* the position Davis supports, providing solid reasons and examples for this article in addition to those of your own; or
- Argue *against* the position Davis supports, countering his reasons and examples with those of your own.
- 2. Only one of the seven different instances Davis provides for "following the rules" lives up to his conception of what students should be taught in learning their respective professional codes of ethics. Explain how Davis arrives at this conclusion. Do you think he has argued adequately against his original criticism of the legalistic view of "merely following the rules"? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Explain how Davis distinguishes his final type of rule obedience from the other six and provide good reasons to argue *for* his conclusion that he has adequately answered his original criticism of the legalistic point of view; or
- Explain how Davis distinguishes his final type of rule obedience from the other six and provide good reasons to argue *against* his conclusion that he has adequately answered his original criticism of the legalistic point of view.

## Joanne B. Ciulla | What Is Good Leadership?

Ciulla discusses the importance have having both an ethical and an effective leader and why it is often difficult to find both qualities in the same individual. When one is emphasized without the other, a leader may have moral character but not be able to effect genuine change or be able to produce end results by questionable means.

Multi	nle	Cho	ice (	Oue	stions
IVIGILI		CHO	100	Que	Juons

tiple Choice Questions	
<ol> <li>*A leader who is both ethical and effective is         <ul> <li>a. not hard to find.</li> <li>b. immoral.</li> <li>c. irrational.</li> <li>d. *often difficult to find.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>	
<ul> <li>2. Whereas earlier authors upheld the moral virtues of leaders over their personality traits, by the twentieth century, scholars <ul> <li>a. stressed intention over results.</li> <li>b. *focused more on the personality traits of leaders than their ethics.</li> <li>c. focused more on the virtues needed for leading a good life.</li> <li>d. argued that good ethics were necessary for success in business.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
3. *When leaders' actions do not match their values, they lose the they need to be effective with their stakeholders.  a. consistency b. inconsistency c. *trust d. justice	
4. Unethical leaders sometimes come to think that they are the rules.  a. guided by b. bound by c. dedicated to d. *exceptions to	
<ul> <li>5. *According to Ciulla, which of the following is a case of Robinhoodism as opposed to Machiavellianism         <ul> <li>a. suitable ends justified by immoral means</li> <li>b. stealing for a bad cause</li> <li>c. *stealing for a good cause</li> <li>d. appropriate means used to justify morally suspect ends</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	ι?
<ul> <li>6. Who wrote, "The intentions or reasons for an act tell us something about the morality of the person, but the ends of an act tell us about the morality of the action"?</li> <li>a. Rakesh Khurana</li> <li>b. *John Stuart Mill</li> <li>c. Benjamin Franklin</li> <li>d. Dale Carnegie</li> </ul>	he
7. *If a leader is, good moral intentions can still lead to an unethical outcome.  a. *incompetent b. competent c. overzealous d. outraged	

- 8. Leaders with overzealous moral convictions may be likely to do any of the following EXCEPT
  - a. confuse working for God with being God.
  - b. \*realize their moral obligation to consult with experts.
  - c. forget to get their facts straight.
  - d. forget to follow standard health procedures.

- 9. \*The moral margin of error is much smaller for leaders than for others because
  - a. they are not in the public eye.
  - b. the effect of their actions on others is not noticeable.
  - c. \*the effect of their actions on others is greater.
  - d. the effect of their actions on others is smaller.
- 10. Good leaders do NOT require
  - a. humility.
  - b. \*self-righteousness.
  - c. help from people who will tell them the truth.
  - d. the ability to admit wrong.

#### **Essay Questions**

1. According to Ciulla, it is difficult to find examples of leaders who are both ethical *and* effective. Do you agree with Ciulla that this is the case and that it is important for educators to not only teach their students "how to do things right" but also to "do the right thing"? Why or why not?

### A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Ciulla's position on how these qualities are related in both the education and professional life of a leader, providing solid reasons and appropriate examples from the article as well as those of your own; or
- Argue *against* Ciulla's position on how these qualities are related in both the education and professional life of a leader, providing solid reasons and appropriate examples from the article as well as those of your own.
- 2. Ciulla emphasizes *humility* as a character trait of a good leader. Do you agree with her depiction of how humility functions with respect to being an ethical and effective leader? Why or why not? Provide specific examples.

## A good essay will either:

- Articulate and defend Ciulla's view on the role of humility in the professional life of a leader, citing appropriate examples from the article in addition to those of your own; or
- Articulate and refute Ciulla's view on the role of humility in the professional life of a leader, countering examples from the article in addition to those of your own.

### Richard A. Wasserstrom | Lawyers as Professionals: Some Moral Issues

Wasserstrom discusses moral issues that arise when examining the lawyer–client relationship, focusing in particular on role-differentiated behavior among professionals. Providing a number of supporting reasons, he makes a case for a type of "deprofessionalizing" the legal profession that would counter the effects of the usual paternalistic and impersonal relationship between lawyers and clients.

- 1. \*Wasserstrom examines all of the following ethical criticisms of lawyers, EXCEPT their
  - a. morally objectionable and dominant role with clients.
  - b. impersonal, paternalistic behavior toward clients.
  - c. systematically amoral dealings with the rest of mankind.
  - d. \*collegial partnership with clients.
- 2. The special relationship between professionals and clients, according to Wasserstrom, is generally due to behavior.
  - a. passive
  - b. \*role-differentiated
  - c. cognitive
  - d. impulsive
- 3. \*In comparing lawyers to parents and scientists, Wasserstrom is making the point that

- a. lawyers must put their own interests above their clients'.
- b. clients are not owed representation if they are guilty.
- c. \*it is often necessary to put aside moral considerations when championing a client's self-interest.
- d. there is never a reason for overstepping moral guidelines when it comes to representing a client's self-interest.
- 4. Compelling a rape victim to submit to a psychiatric examination before trial is an example of the court a defense procedure that a lawyer may personally find morally objectionable.
  - a. barring
  - b. proscribing
  - c. diverting
  - d. \*permitting
- 5. \*The adversary system only works if
  - a. the opposing parties enter a restorative justice program.
  - b. the opposing parties are represented by the same lawyer.
  - c. \*each party has a lawyer who pleads the merits of his or her case and the demerits of the opponent's.
  - d. each party pleads guilty.
- 6. The \_\_\_\_\_ of the lawyer guarantees that every criminal defendant, guilty or innocent, deserves to be well represented.
  - a. approach
  - b. \*amorality
  - c. inclination
  - d. intuition
- 7. \*The relationship of inequality between lawyers and clients is intrinsic to the existence of professionalism for all of the following reasons EXCEPT
  - a. lawyers possess expert knowledge.
  - b. lawyers possess technical language.
  - c. clients lack the objectivity required to effectively represent themselves.
  - d. \*clients are in a position to evaluate how well the professionals perform.
- 8. According to Wasserstrom, lawyers tend to see their clients as rather than persons.
  - a. \*objects
  - b. experts
  - c. professionals
  - d. adults
- 9. \*Paternalism occurs when
  - a. clients think they know better than their lawyers.
  - b. \*lawyers think they know better than their clients.
  - c. clients are patronizing toward their lawyers.
  - d. lawyers behave in a weak and vulnerable manner toward their clients.
- 10. "Deprofessionalizing the law," according to Wasserstrom, would
  - a. strengthen equal partnership in the lawyer-client relationship.
  - b. strengthen the amoral approach of lawyers toward their clients.
  - c. weaken the ethical codes of lawyers.
  - d. \*weaken features of the lawyer-client relationship that produce paternalistic and impersonal relationships.

#### **Essay Questions**

1. Do you agree with Wasserstrom that the unequal relationship between lawyers and clients leads to viewing clients not as adult persons but more as children or even objects? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Argue that Wasserstrom is correct in his determination of how lawyers view clients and present corroborating reasons and examples drawn from the text in support of this thesis; or
- Argue that Wasserstrom is incorrect in his determination of how lawyers view clients by presenting your own corroborating reasons and examples countering this thesis.
- 2. Wasserstrom believes that lawyers should be more rather than less moral in fulfilling their duties toward clients and presents a number of reasons in support of this thesis. Present his argument clearly, stating these supporting reasons, and discuss whether or not you are in agreement with the author and why.

A good essay will:

- Present Wasserstrom's thesis that lawyers should be more rather than less moral in fulfilling their duties toward clients.
- Clearly and correctly identify Wasserstrom's premises in support of this thesis.
- Present your defense or refutation of this argument utilizing sound reasoning, well-chosen examples, insightful analogies, and so on.

#### Samuel Gorovitz | Good Doctors

c. \*detachment; sensitivityd. intellect; intelligence

According to Gorovitz, medical schools ought to impart not just technical knowledge but also ethical values and practical experience. He offers a number of suggestions on how best to achieve this goal to ensure that future doctors are equipped not only with the best of current knowledge and skills but also with the moral sensitivity necessary to communicate well with patients in complex situations.

IVIC	Iltiple Choice Questions
	1. *Gorovitz believes that medical education fails to incorporate sufficient training in the that
	arise in the practice of medicine.  a. technical skills
	b. textbook facts
	c. *ethical issues
	d. specialized areas
	2. Which of the following is NOT a characteristic of a good physician?
	a. a high level of technical competence
	b. appreciation for the experimental nature of clinical medicine
	c. sensitivity to the diversity of interpersonal relationships
	d. *viewing patients not as whole persons but as ailing bodies
	3. *Unlike Plato, Aristotle felt that right action flows from one's, not from understanding
	alone.
	a. *will
	b. motivation
	c. intellect
	d. imagination
	4. Gorovitz finds strengths and weaknesses in Aristotle's view that the best way to bring moral judgment
	within the sphere of education is
	a. habitation.
	b. *habituation.
	c. memorization.
	d. visualization.
	5. *A good physician needs to strike a balance between and to successfully
	interact with patients.
	a. habituation; novelty
	b. behavior; cognition

- 6. The film of the badly burned victim focuses on which of the following ethical issues?
  - a. beginning-of-life issues
  - b. stem cell research
  - c. \*the right to refuse treatment
  - d. the allocation of medical resources
- 7. \*The author discusses a number of methods for incorporating ethical and moral issues into the medical curriculum. Which is the one he favors?
  - a. at the beginning of the curriculum
  - b. \*intermittently, throughout the curriculum
  - c. at the end of the curriculum
  - d. during internships and on-the-job training
- 8. Since physicians are often asked to provide expertise in matters of public policy, they also need to have been trained in \_\_\_\_\_\_ responsibility.
  - a. surgical
  - b. technical
  - c. historical
  - d. \*social
- 9. \*According to Gorovitz, medical school admission committees could elevate the character of future doctors by selecting students who
  - a. do not perform well in premed courses but demonstrate concern for the humanistic side of health care.
  - b. \*perform superbly well in premed courses in addition to demonstrating concern for the humanistic side of health care.
  - c. focus exclusively on the premed requirements of the sciences.
  - d. focus exclusively on the humanities and philosophy.
- 10. Since medical science changes through time, medical ethics should NOT be taught as a
  - a. response to changing technology.
  - b. response to changing law.
  - c. changing body of information.
  - d. \*fixed body of information.

### **Essay Questions**

1. Gorovitz's main thesis is that medical education ought to focus more on ethical issues in the course of teaching students the technical skills and knowledge necessary for becoming physicians. What reasons and examples does he provide in support of this view, and how would you evaluate the importance of this view?

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Gorovitz's view by stating his reasons and examples followed by a detailed comparison to the need for increased ethical awareness in another profession (such as the law, education, counseling, consulting, etc.); or
- Argue *against* Gorovitz's view by countering his reasons that (i) what is taught currently in medical schools is sufficient, (ii) medical ethics cannot be taught, only learned in practice, or (iii) medical ethics should be taught only to undergraduates, not in medical school.
- 2. Gorovitz mentions a number of avenues that could be pursued by which more adequate and applicable moral education could be brought into medical education, finding one more promising than the others. Do you agree with his assessment in this case? Why or why not? If so, explain what this addition to the medical curriculum would impart to students. If not, what might be a better way to accomplish this task?

A good essay will either:

• Articulate the various methods and provide your reasons for *agreeing* with Gorovitz, specifically by stating how and why this particular method is important; or

• Articulate the various methods and provide your reasons for disagreeing with Gorovitz, adding your own version of what might work better to accomplish this task.

Preston Stovall | Professional Virtue, Professional Self-Awareness, and Engineering Ethics

Stovall introduces Aristotle's main arguments and definitions from the Nicomachean Ethics and discusses how professional virtue can best be seen as a subset of Aristotle's ethical virtues. He uses the example of professional engineering virtues to make his case, further emphasizing the role of professional self-awareness in developing a flourishing and successful professional career.

- 1. \*According to Aristotle and many Greek thinkers of his day, the essential function that distinguishes humans from animals is
  - a. virtue.
  - b. endurance.
  - c. \*rational activity.
  - d. excellence.
- 2. For Aristotle, ethical virtues, as opposed to intellectual virtues,
  - a. are pursued as ends in themselves.
  - b. \*are pursued as means to some further end.
  - c. should not be considered as means to an end.
  - d. exemplified by theoretical wisdom and science.
- 3. \*Stovall states that professional ethics can be seen as a *teleological*, or an Aristotle's ethical virtues. a. intrinsic

  - b. extrinsic
  - c. \*end-directed
  - d. experimental
- 4. According to Stovall, professional ethics characterized as Aristotelian ethical virtues support the individual in building
  - a. self-interest.
  - b. confidence.
  - c. financial security.
  - d. \*a successful career.
- 5. \*Stovall states that the of a profession is that which uniquely specifies it as the profession it is.
  - a. ethics
  - b. status
  - c. \*function
  - d. education
- 6. Which of the following is NOT a hazard of professional development, according to Stovall?
  - a. confusing personal monetary gain with the profession's purpose in society
  - b. valuing personal social status over the profession's function in society
  - c. \*consciously reflecting and judging our own values and behavior
  - d. conflating the value of careers with the social value of our professions
- 7. \*Stovall states that the exercise of professional virtue requires, above all else,
  - a. recognition.
  - b. ambition.
  - c. self-interest.
  - d. \*self-awareness.

8. For Aristotle, it is the virtue of	that mediates between human rationality and professional
behavior.	
a. *practical wisdom	
b. theoretical wisdom	
c. intuition	
d. aspiration	
9. *In a well-ordered society, according to S a. functional b. practical c. *successful d. essential	tovall, the virtuous professional is the professional.
10. Teaching professional ethics, for Stovall, environments.  a. virtuous; dishonorable b. virtual; habitual c. *educational; professional d. national; international	should occur both in the and

## **Essay Questions**

1. Do you agree with Stovall's description of the role of professional self-awareness in mitigating the extremes of narrow, personal ambition and unrealistic idealism? Use Stovall's example of the engineering profession to illustrate your answer.

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Stovall's view, providing his own and your own reasons in support of this thesis, using the engineering profession to illustrate your defense of this view; or
- Argue *against* Stovall's view, countering Stovall's reasons for this view with your own reasons for the opposing thesis, using the engineering profession to illustrate your refutation of this view.
- 2. Stovall discusses the relationship between being professionally virtuous and having a flourishing and successful career, understood as following from Aristotle's model of the ethical virtues. Do you agree with his assessment? Why or why not?

A good essay will either:

- Argue *for* Stovall's view, providing his own and your own reasons in support of this thesis and illustrations from examples from this article; or
- Argue *against* Stovall's view, countering Stovall's reasons for this view with your own reasons for the opposing thesis and illustrations from your own experience.

## Case 1.1: "Professionalism and Nursing"

## **Essay Questions**

- 1. Diane and Arlene disagree about whether Diane's extra, unpaid work with the interdisciplinary team will result in better care for patients and a higher regard for the nursing profession. Briefly explain each of their arguments. Which do you think is stronger, and why?
- 2. How do personal considerations, such as being single or having children, play a role in deciding who should be able to hold more responsibility or devote more time to one's daily profession or work? Should considerations such as these be relevant in a case like Diane's? Explain your answer.

Case 1.2: Nick Denton, "Less Heat, More Light"

**Essay Questions** 

- 1. Nick Denton mentions a number of positive characteristics of part-time as opposed to full-time workers. How did he arrive at these views? Do you find them convincing? Offer reasons of your own that either support or undermine Denton's views about part-time work.
- 2. The authors in this chapter have presented various approaches to understanding the relationship between professional ethics and one's colleagues, clients, supervisors, and oneself. Do you think a 120%-er would necessarily be more or less professionally ethical than an 80%-er? Why or why not?

## Case 1.3: Michael C. Loui, "The Professional Engineer"

- 1. How would you apply the *inverse pyramid* model of a professional organization to the characteristics for engineers mentioned in this list, given that professionals have a tendency to "manage their own bosses"?
- 2. Individual characteristics, such as accuracy and independence, are listed alongside team-building skills, such as collaboration and good communication. How would you incorporate these disparate characteristics into the professional training of an engineer?

## **Chapter 1 Suggested Readings & Resources**

1. Center for the Study of Ethics in the Professions

#### http://ethics.iit.edu/about

CSEP is located on the campus of Illinois Institute of Technology; the website contains a wealth of information, including current research, teaching, recent publications, online and print collections, and other resources

2. Examples of codes of ethics and professional codes of conduct. http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/en/examples-of-codes-of-ethics-00868

3. McAuliffe, Donna. "Clutching at Codes." *Professional Ethics, A Multidisciplinary Journal* 7.3–4 (1999): 9–24.

From the introduction: "There is nothing more likely to strike fear into the heart of the bravest professional than the threat or possibility of being held accountable for an alleged ethical violation."

4. Stone, Pamela "OPTING OUT Challenging Stereotypes and Creating Real Options for Women in the Professions" Harvard Business School, 2013 Research Symposium on Gender & Work: Challenging Conventional Wisdom.

http://www.hbs.edu/faculty/conferences/2013-w50-research-symposium/Documents/stone.pdf

Download PowerPoint at: http://www.slideserve.com/thimba/opting-out-challenging-stereotypes-and-creating-real-options-for-women

5. Pettifor, Jean L. "Are Professional Codes of Ethics Relevant for Multicultural Counselling?" *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy/Revue canadienne de counseling et de psychothérapie* 35.1 (2007): 26–35.

# http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ622696.pdf

From the abstract: "Paul Pederson's three main criticisms of professional codes of ethics—that they lack a moral philosophical foundation, that their cultural grounding promotes unintentional racism, and that multicultural issues are trivialized—are reviewed."